THE MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

OF THE ACADEMIC SENATE

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, FRESNO

Fresno, California 93740-8014 Fax: 278-5745

Telephone: 278-2743 (EC-13)

March 28, 2022

Members present: Raymond Hall (Chair), Tinneke Van Camp (Vice Chair), Rich DeJordy (At-Large), Kathleen Dyer (Universitywide), Xuanning Fu (Interim Provost), D’Aungillique Jackson (ASI Executive President), Saúl Jiménez-Sandoval (President), Jennifer Miele (At-Large), Rebecca Raya-Fernandez (At-Large), Susan Schlievert (Statewide)

Members excused:

Guests: Venita Baker (Academic Senate), Keith Clement (Chair Undergraduate Curriculum Committee), James Mullooly (Chair AP&P), Bernadette Muscat (Dean of Undergraduate Studies), Jim Schmidtke (Interim AVP Academic Affairs), Katy Tarrant (Chair OBE subcommittee), Laura Yager (Registrar’s Office)

The meeting was called to order by Chair Hall at 3:00 pm on Zoom.

1. Approval of the Agenda.

MSC

1. Approval of the Minutes 03.14.22.

Senator DeJordy offered an amendment: it is QLT, not QOLT.

Amended throughout.

Approval of minutes as amended: approved

1. Communications and Announcements.

Communications from the President:

The President has been working with the Provost on the Fall 2022 scheduling, which will involve a return to more in-person instruction.

He then updated the committee about the progress on assembling the Title IX task force on our campus. An attorney has also been appointed to lead an investigation, from a firm that is recognized for its work in Title IX issues. Ours is the first campus to undergo this investigation and will be a model for the CSU.

A new interim Chancellor has been appointed. Dr. Koester was a faculty member and Provost at Sacramento State, and later President at Northridge. She has been a consultant for AASCU.

An investigation and assessment of resources of the CSU regarding Title IX will also be launched through the Chancellor’s Office.

We will be welcoming 6,000 students and their families on our campus following recruitment efforts made at community colleges for Fall 2022 enrollment.

The President has asked VP Adishian-Astone to prepare a budget presentation for the Senate, including a presentation by the Provost about the new formula used to allocate funds to Colleges and Schools.

The President has launched a President’s Commission on economic development, societal impact and entrepreneurship. Fifty faculty members attended from three involved Colleges and Schools (Agriculture, Business and Engineering). There was a lot of good creative energy in the room.

He also informed the committee that he has been organizing a Mariachi festival on our campus, including some of the best Mariachi bands from Mexico. This will take place on May 7 in the SaveMart Center. Proceeds will go to student scholarships. He has secured and is seeking additional sponsorship.

The CSSA have selected President Jiménez-Sandoval for their President of the Year Award. The President thanked ASI President Jackson for her support. He added that this award represents us all.

*Questions for the President:*

**Senator DeJordy** wanted to know, in the context of the staff teleworking policy, whether faculty can keep offices open, if they are willing, when there is no staff available due to teleworking.

**President Jiménez-Sandoval** responded that faculty might be willing, but this would need to be checked with the union partners. He added that the university is in the process of sending out a survey about teleworking.

**Senator Dyer** asked whether the CSU has agreed that the CSU counsel, not only the Fresno State counsel, will be investigated in the context of the revelations regarding Frank Lamas.

**President Jiménez-Sandoval** confirmed that the full CSU, not only Fresno State, will be investigated.

**Senator Dyer** wanted to know who will be appointed to the Title IX Task Force in addition to the faculty that will be selected today in executive session.

**President Jiménez-Sandoval** responded that Professor Forbes was appointed due to her background in Title IX related issues, Dean Muscat will chair the task force. No other faculty appointments have been made. He was considering an additional faculty appointment and invited the committee to select two instead of one candidate.

Communications from the Provost:

The Provost did not have any communications beyond the discussion about Fall planning that is on today’s agenda.

*No questions for the Provost.*

 **Action Items**

1. Memo dated March 16, 2022, from Keith Clement, Chair of the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate re: Transmittal Memo for Bachelor of Science in Health Administration Degree Program Elevation. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: consent calendar item

1. Memo dated March 16, 2022, from Kathleen Dyer, Chair of the Department of Child and Family Science to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: APM 231 Policy on Adding and Dropping Classes. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: formal policy proposal incorporated under agenda item 7 today

1. Memo dated March 16, 2022, from Keith Clement, Chair of the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Transmittal Memo for Bachelor of Science in Health Sciences Degree Title Change. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: consent calendar item

1. Memo dated March 16, 2022, from Keith Clement, Chair of the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Transmittal Memo for Bachelor of Science in Community Health Degree Title Change. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: consent calendar item

1. Email dated March 22, 2022, from Bernadette Muscat, Dean of Undergraduate Studies to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Academic Calendars (ACal). Email has been received.

Suggestion: on agenda

1. Email dated March 22, 2022, from Kathleen Dyer, Chair of the Student Ratings Subcommittee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Student Ratings Subcommittee Charge Revision. Email has been received.

Suggestion: this concerns a fix of the subcommittee’s charge to have one or two student members, who were supposed to be there all along.

Vote to fix the charge to allow one or two student representatives on the committee as intended: approved

1. Memo dated March 23, 2022, from Keith Clement, Chair of the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Transmittal Memo for Bachelor of Arts in Social Sciences Degree Program. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: consent calendar item

1. Memo dated March 24, 2022, from James Mullooly, Chair of the Academic Policy and Planning Committee to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: The Online and Blended Education Subcommittee Charge. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: on today’s agenda due to high priority

1. Memo dated March 24, 2022, from James Mullooly, Anthropology Department Senator to Raymond Hall, Chair of the Academic Senate, re: Bachelor of Arts in Social Science. Memo has been received.

Suggestion: consent calendar item

1. Nominees (Executive Session):
	1. Title IX Task Force
	2. Chief Diversity Officer Search

Suggestion: in executive session today

1. New Business.

None

1. APM 206: issues with course approval OBE Committee backlog for Fall 2022. Second Reading.

**Chair Hall** reminded the committee that this concerns the removal of course level assessment in addition to instructor assessment for online course approval.

**Mullooly (Chair AP&P)** added that this would be an interim policy to attenuate the crisis for Fall scheduling. The interim policy offers a clarification on instructor certification. Course certification for online courses was removed, and how instructors are certified was removed.

**Chair Hall** added that this concurs with the consensus to remove the course certification in a previous Executive Committee meeting.

**Senator Dyer** asked how course modality information is managed. Do departments keep a list and decide which courses can be online? This was not discussed before.

**Mullooly** responded that if such a list is needed, the departments should have it. Department curriculum committees could monitor this, rather than Department Chairs, to avoid misuse or misunderstanding.

**Clement (Chair Undergraduate Curriculum Committee)** is happy that this is a temporary interim policy to allow for Fall scheduling. He referred to a master list managed by CFE that can be distributed and that departments can contribute to, instead of relying on department curriculum committees to manage such a list. The University Curriculum Committee should also play a role in this.

Also, there are issues relating to allowing a course that was created by one faculty member to be utilized by other faculty members in their department. The future usability of a course should be addressed, as well as how often it can be used, and compensation for the work done by the faculty member who initially built the course.

**Mullooly** responded that this is something that needs to addressed. There is existing policy and practice that we can rely on until the Senate can deliberate on a new permanent APM 206 next semester.

**Chair Hall** reminded the committee that the interim policy still requires that faculty are trained. Only certified faculty can teach online.

**Mullooly** added that by taking out the course approval procedure, a course modality list might be moot. All that is needed is a list of certified faculty, but it is not specified where this list must be kept. He also suggested that we could require faculty to renew their certification every five years, for instance. The OBE subcommittee or CFE can keep track of faculty certification.

**Clement** raised another issue, and that is that faculty will still need to complete the QLT process for intercampus courses. Course certification for courses on our campus might be removed, but faculty will still need to utilize the process to teach QM or QLT certified courses on other campuses.

**Chair Hall** responded that this was taken into consideration and this would indeed be in place.

**Mullooly** added that this issue is beyond APM 206.

**ASI President Jackson** wanted to note that, while she agreed with the Executive Committee earlier that course review should be removed, she would like to reconsider this following her attendance of an OBE subcommittee meeting. She suggested that we should be working to ensure that all students taking online courses get the same quality instruction. She will be happy to revisit this in the fall when we discuss permanent changes to APM 206.

**Tarrant (Chair OBE subcommittee)** shared that the OBE subcommittee supports that faculty will continue to having to be certified. But the OBE subcommittee believes that continued course review is needed as well to ensure quality online instruction. The current heavy workload of the subcommittee is due to the campus coming out of the pandemic. Faculty could be notified that they need to foresee enough time to prepare a course request. Being upfront about the deadlines will go a long way to mitigate the subcommittee’s workload.

**Schmidtke** returned to the issue of reusing materials from one faculty by other faculty members. This is addressed in CBA article 39 and concerns intellectual property.

**Senator DeJordy** agreed that there needs to be some quality control, but offered that getting additional training following initial faculty certification can be helpful in this sense.

**Senator Dyer** offered that the current OBE subcommittee workload issue is not due to the pandemic only. There had already been a backlog prior to the pandemic. She added that we hire people to teach face-to-face and we believe they come prepared to teach. There is a big disparity in approval of online and in-person teaching.

**Tarrant** responded that the system that is being used by the subcommittee, OnBase, is new, and there have been some issues with it, which added to delays. She mentioned that course requests for which all material was available, has already been taken off the docket. Courses remaining in the docket now are courses for which not all materials were provided by the requester. A checklist has been created to streamline the process. She suggested to continue to do course reviews, but to create a working group to identify issues with the current OBE approval process.

**Mullooly** responded that AP&P unanimously approved removing course certification and emphasizing instructor certification. The university has spent money on training faculty. Instructor certification is where we historically focused our efforts on. The course certification requirement for online courses slows down the process to boldly teach.

**Clement** mentioned that APM 206 came into existence in Fall 2018 and was implemented right before the start of the pandemic, making this a relatively new policy. He added that while faculty who teach in person courses might not have to be certified to teach, QM and QLT certification is required for online teaching. This is an externally granted certification.

**Chair Hall** asked whether faculty certification alone meets QM and QLT certification.

**Clement** confirmed that that is the case.

**ASI President Jackson** argued that the fact that in-person course material is not certified is no reason not to certify online course material. Hence, maybe we should hold all courses to a higher standard overall.

**Chair Hall** responded that we are all concerned about instructor excellence. All courses need to be evaluated, which is why we have a system of peer and student evaluations. Hence, we may need to improve and strengthen the existing structures of peer and student evaluation. Also, we are still ensuring that faculty are trained to teach online.

**Vice Chair Van Camp** echoed the value of strengthening existing structures for peer and student evaluation.

**Chair Hall** suggested to send the interim policy, with removal of course certification but maintaining instructor certification, to the Senate floor.

**Provost Fu** mentioned that he is working on a memo to Department Chairs about Fall 2022 course modalities. In it, it will be highlighted that two thirds of courses need to be scheduled as in-person instruction. Retention has suffered significantly due to online teaching. If COVID increases again, we will need to pivot to more online courses, of course. Also, all the modalities that we have been offering during the pandemic can continue to be offered. He added that the new permanent APM 206, to be discussed in Senate in fall, will need to account for synchronous online, hybrid and HyFlex modalities.

**Chair Hall** reminded the committee that a draft of this communication has been shared with the committee. It includes that a synchronous online modality is available for scheduling, and that not more than 33 per cent of teaching can be a non-traditional modality of teaching, or two thirds of courses having to be face-to-face.

**Senator Dyer** appreciated this guidance. She requested from the Provost to change the framing of this communication as planning for Fall 2022. Fall 2022 has already been planned and student wish lists are already open. The campus wide schedule is done and it mainly meets the Provost’s requirement for two thirds in-person instruction. There is only a handful of departments that have more than 30 per cent not in-person courses for Fall 2022. The memo could also be shorter.

**Senator DeJordy** offered to frame the communication as concerning increased flexibility but within certain limits.

**Senator DeJordy** also suggested that down the road we will need to have different sorts of guidelines for lower and upper division courses in terms of requirements for proportion of face-to-face instruction. Face-to-face instruction is more important for lower division courses in terms of retention.

**Provost Fu** will keep this tiered consideration in mind. He added that it also depends on discipline.

**Schmidtke** added that HyFlex teaching still requires a faculty to be in the class room for face-to-face.

**Senator Miele** wanted to know whether the two thirds of in-person instruction requirement concerns sections of courses, or courses?

**Provost Fu** responded that it concerns course sections.

**Provost Fu** will revise the memo and send it to the Executive Committee for final input. He added that the scheduling office will send specific instructions to Department Chairs on how to code classes with the new teaching modalities.

**Chair Hall** invited Mullooly to explain the proposal from AP&P for a new charge for the OBE subcommittee in light of changes to APM 206.

**Mullooly** explained that the OBE subcommittee charge is under the purview of the Chair of the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee, but that AP&P offered a draft of a new potential charge. The original charge of the OBE subcommittee includes three main assignments, the third of which concerns course review, which is being removed from APM 206. In addition to the two remaining assignments, AP&P offered some suggestions. The final approval of this rests with the Executive Committee. In addition to the remaining initial assignments new additional assignments to replace course review could include building Canvas Templates, building Peer Review Templates, acting as the faculty oversight body for CFE, suggesting alternative means of assessment that are less susceptible to cheating and plagiarism, recommending instructor certification standards and associated CFE curricula for faculty training, recommending best practices.

**Tarrant** suggested to include course proposal for CSU wide courses.

**Senator Dyer** agreed that we need to beef up processes to monitor online courses and put mechanisms in place to improve peer evaluation of online courses once an online course starts, rather than requiring course certification before a course starts. She was therefore in favor of these changes to the charge of the OBE subcommittee.

**Schmidtke** warned that if the OBE subcommittee would be doing peer reviews, this needs to be checked with the CFA and CBA.

**Chair Hall** suggested that Clement and Tarrant further discuss the charge for the OBE subcommittee.

1. APM 360 Policy on Sabbatical and Difference-in-Pay (DIP) Leaves.

Will be discussed at the next meeting.

1. Student Withdrawal policy update. Second Reading.

**Chair Hall** explained that APM 231 will be discussed at the next meeting.

**Yager (Registrar’s Office)** explained that the project to automate the process for drop and withdrawal requests was paused for now. She added that it has been practice that if an instructor denies a request and a Chair approves, the office follows the Chair. This has now been challenged by a faculty member. It also does not concur with language in the EO. It has been noted that various campuses do things differently.

**Senator Dyer** proposed that, in case of a discrepancy between a Chair and instructor, the Dean of Graduate or Dean of Undergraduate Studies should decide.

**Dean Muscat** is fine with this proposal.

**Senator DeJordy** supported it as well. He wanted to know whether we should get the EO amended.

**Dean Muscat** explained that she is in consultation with the Chancellor’s Office. They are working on it and it could take years to update the EO, but they are aware and we can go ahead to deal with this.

**Chair Hall** offered that this should be codified in the APM.

**Dean Muscat** wanted to know whether this could be piloted and to align the APM after the pilot.

**Chair Hall** responded that an interim policy can be discussed in our next meeting. Meanwhile the Registrar’s Office can go ahead with its online process.

1. Executive Session (Title IX Task Force and Chief Diversity Officer Search Committee)

Entered into executive session at 4:48 pm

Appointment to the search committee for Chief Diversity Officer:

Veena Howard (Arts and Humanities) and Katie Dyer (COSS).

Appointment to the Title IX Task Force:

Kate Kafonek (COSS)

The Executive Committee suggested to also appoint Brian Tsukimura (CSM) and/or Melissa Garrett (CSM) to the task force.

-------------------------

The Senate Executive Committee adjourned at 5:13 pm.

The next meeting of the Executive Committee will be held on April 18 via Zoom.

Submitted by: Approved by:

Tinneke Van Camp Raymond Hall

Vice Chair Chair

Academic Senate Academic Senate